Educational Adequacy: Leading the dialogue about educational process and outcomes

Richard Green Scholar Presentation
MASA Fall Conference
10/8/13

Aaron Ruhland
Director of Learning and Accountability
Orono Public Schools
What is Educational Adequacy?

How is it determined?

What issues impact adequacy analyses?

How can we lead the dialogue?
What does the public expect from us?

Has the state provided sufficient resources?

How do we define organizational success?

How do we prioritize organizational resources?

My Interest in this topic

What makes me feel successful?

How do I spend my time?
What prompted this inquiry?

Questions:

• Do schools have the necessary resources to meet current demands and needs?
• How do existing resource structures, policies, and practices support or inhibit meeting the needs of all students?
• Can we sustain the comprehensive expectations of our public schools?
What prompted this inquiry?

Concerns:
• State funding has not kept pace with inflation and new money is targeted.
• Additional mandates seem to be more politically oriented than about educational effectiveness.
• Local citizens and leaders have limited influence on policy decisions that substantially impact work.
• Inequities in achievement and available resources.
• General sense of incongruence
Plausible conclusions:

• These issues and ongoing structural deficits in the state budget make an adequacy-based legal challenge plausible.

• Conditions are right for change (Mazzoni, 1991)
  – Pressure
  – Resource scarcity
  – Macro-Arena

• If an adequacy-based legal challenge occurs, variables are highly malleable.
Leadership: Defining success

Sphere of influence

Focus and breadth

Outcomes
Hope and opportunity

Public Education as the 21st century Ellis Island

"Keep, ancient lands, your storied pomp!" cries she With silent lips. "Give me your tired, your poor, Your huddled masses yearning to breathe free, The wretched refuse of your teeming shore. Send these, the homeless, tempest-tost to me, I lift my lamp beside the golden door!"

_Emma Lazarus_ "The New Colossus"
The pathway to Adequacy
Finance litigation: Three waves

- **Equal protection**
  
  *San Antonio Independent School District v. Rodriguez:* not a federal “fundamental right”

- **Equity**
  
  "fiscal neutrality“ or horizontal/vertical equity

- **Adequacy**
  
  Quality: Assuring schools reach a minimum standard

  *Lobato v. Colorado*

Definitions of Adequacy

**Rose v. Council for Better Education (Kentucky)**

Student capabilities to participate in “citizenship and the labor market”

**Claremont v. Governor of New Hampshire**

“Social, economic, scientific, technological, and political knowledge”

**Campaign for Fiscal Equity (CFE), Inc. v. State of New York**

Meaningful civic engagement

Being able to hold a job above low grade work

**State v. Campbell County School District (Wyoming)**

“Basket of educational goods and services”
Minnesota Constitution article XIII, section 1
“uniform, thorough, and efficient system of public schools”

Finance system was providing adequate funding

P.S. Minnesota (Silverstein, Rose, & Myers, 2006)
97-99% of school districts were not adequately funded
Methods for determining adequacy
How is Adequacy determined?

- Inputs, processes, & outputs (Alexander, 2004)
- Four methods:
  - Cost function approach
  - Successful schools approach
  - Professional judgment approach
  - Evidence-based approach
How is Adequacy determined?

Exploring the changing face of adequacy (Alexander, 2004)

- Inputs: Does money matter?
- Processes: How does money matter?
- Outputs: Definitions of success
Econometric models

Cost Function and Successful Schools Approaches

Inputs
Defined by: Monetary resources

Processes

Outputs
Defined by: Statute & tests
Econometric perspectives

http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=BXZmYsHvO1c

Eric Hanushek, Senior Fellow
Hoover Institution
Stanford University
Judgment-based models

Professional Judgment and Evidence-Based approaches

Processes Defined by: Professionals or evidence

Inputs

Outputs Defined by: Statute or courts
Judgment-based perspectives

Allan Odden, Director
Consortium for Policy Research in Education (CPRE),
University of Wisconsin- Madison

http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=bmUY82_jUQ
“We prefer the professional judgment approach, not because we believe it is more precise than statistical or inferential methods (it may not be more precise), but rather because its imprecision is more transparent” (p. 231).

Guthrie & Rothstein, (1999)
Fundamental challenges to adequacy analysis
Three challenges

- There are varied perspectives on the purpose of education – **Public & private good** (Mitchell & Mitchell, 2003)
- **Outputs are narrowly defined and measured**, including the level at which we define success
- **Political factors** underlie educational policy
  - Policy-making is not always rationale yet is the basis for adequacy decisions
  - Political factors contribute to efficiency and effectiveness
  - Policies and policy instruments may or may not be congruent with local stakeholders
The political economy of educational policy: The case of class size reduction (Mitchell & Mitchell, 2003)
Additional perspectives

• A means to develop democracy and moral citizens (Viteritti, 2004)
• Reinforcement of morals, ethics and democratic principles (Wraga, 2001)
• Citizenship, socialization, college readiness, & achievement test performance (Belfield & Levin, 2002)
• Essential to democracy and economic growth for society (Ntiri, 2001)
Outputs

What, why, and how do we measure?
Standards and course requirements
Language arts
Mathematics
Science
Social studies: including geography, economics, and government and citizenship
Physical education
Arts: including media arts, dance, music, theater, and/or visual arts
Career and technical education
World languages

Attribute and skill requirements
Worlds Best Workforce
School readiness
Reading proficiently by 3rd grade
Closing the achievement gap
Career and college readiness (Mathematics, Reading, & Writing)
High School graduation

Student plans identifying: 21st century skills such as team work, collaboration, and good work habits.

ELA Standards: Independence, content knowledge, responsiveness, ability to critique, use technology & digital media, understand other cultures
Outputs: Econometric studies

Standards and course requirements

**Language arts** courses & proficiency
**Mathematics** courses & proficiency
**Science** courses & proficiency

Attribute and skill requirements

- Reading proficiently by 3rd grade

(Mathematics, Reading, & Writing)

High School graduation
Outputs: Measurement

What, why, and how do we measure?

Outputs

Low Achievement

High

Less $ Expenditures More $
Outsputs: Measurement

What, why, and how do we measure?

Outputs

Low Achievement

Less $  Expenditures  More $

High
Outputs: District examples

All students will...

continually achieve their stated aspirations.

use and interpret the arts, music and literature.

demonstrate and promote cultural understanding of self and others to become involved members of a global community.

graduate college and career ready.

understand and model the core ethical values that lead to good character.
Outputs: Future oriented

Outputs: Future oriented

Political values and cultures

- Political incongruence as a source of inefficiency
  - Political values: Efficiency vs. quality and fraternity (Fowler, 2004)
  - Policy orientations and instruments (McDonnell & Elmore, 1987)

- Dominant political ideologies and people exclude perspectives (Heck, 2004)
  - Policy monopolies: finance reform and standards-based accountability (McDonnell, 2010)
  - Policy insiders (Marshal, et al., 1986)

- Irrational nature of policy development (Augenblick, et al., 1997)
- Policy development and enactment incongruence (Louis, et. al. 2005)
“We suspect that weights are often determined by political and budgetary concerns, rather than by a careful assessment of the costs associated with meeting any given performance standard” (p. 376).

Reschovsky & Imazeki (2001)

“If one tried to take advantage of the messiness of the educational policy system rather than cleaning it up, constructive, creative approaches might be developed locally” (p. 26).

Firestone (1989)
## Political v. Evidence-based

### Model policies and indicators (ALEC, 2013)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Model Policy/Indicator</th>
<th>Effect Size (Hattie, 2009)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Academic Standards</td>
<td>NA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Charter Schools</td>
<td>.2 (Low – Medium)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Home-School regulation reduction</td>
<td>NA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Private school choice</td>
<td>NA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher quality (policy mechanisms: system-changing)</td>
<td>Different mechanisms</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Online learning</td>
<td>.24 (substantial variability)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A-Plus Literacy Act</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Retention</td>
<td>-0.16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alternate certification</td>
<td>NA (Training = .11)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

[http://www.alec.org/task-forces/education/](http://www.alec.org/task-forces/education/)
Leadership: Challenges

Sphere of influence

Focus and breadth

Outcomes
An approach that is inclusive of local citizens and leaders
An inclusive model

Processes
Defined by: Professionals and evidence

Inputs
Defined by: econometrics & local panels

Outputs
Defined by: Statute & local panels
An inclusive approach

- Perspectives about the purpose and outputs of schools drive analysis
- Local citizens and leaders have a voice: Local panels
- Transparency and communication about educational outputs and resources
- Deriving a combination of state and local elements may minimize inefficiency created by political incongruence
Lingering questions

- How will Minnesota define “uniform, thorough, & efficient?”
- What are the underlying political values evident in communities across the state of Minnesota?
- How do Minnesota educational leaders and local citizens perceive these values impact educational purpose and outputs?
- What do Minnesota educational leaders and local citizens perceive as the consensus and non-consensus educational outputs and how do those differ across communities?
Hope and opportunity

http://vimeo.com/60017252
Leadership: Next steps

Sphere of influence

Focus and breadth

Outcomes
References


References


